

## Minutes of Sixth Meeting of ETEC

Dated: 04.09.2018

Minutes of Meetings of Empowered Technical Evaluation Committee (ETEC) held at NHIDCL New Delhi on 13.08.2018 at 11:00 AM for Consultancy Services for Authority's Engineer for supervision of:

(i) Up-gradation to 4-lane with Paved Shoulder of Jammu-Akhnoor road section of NH-144A from Canal head (Km 0.800) to Ganesh Vihar (Km 6.000) of 5.2 Km length

(ii) Up-gradation to 4-lane with Paved Shoulder of Jammu-Akhnoor road section of NH-144A from Ganesh Vihar (Km 6.000) to Hanuman Chowk (Km 30.000) of 24 Km length in the state of Jammu and Kashmir to be executed on EPC basis.

(iii) Widening and Up-gradation to 2 lane with paved shoulder configuration and geometric improvement from km 0.000 to km 16.990 on Chenani - Sudhmahadev section of NH-244 in the state of Jammu and Kashmir to be executed on EPC basis

1. The Member Secretary apprised the Committee that during the Fourth Meeting of ETEC, and as directed by the Competent Authority, the two CVs namely of Sh Ashok Gupta & Sh Jagdish Kumar Gupta were not evaluated which were submitted by M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. in association with Segmental Consulting & Infrastructure Advisory Pvt. Ltd. on account of names of these two Key Personnel in matriculation certificate & in degree certificates being different from the names mentioned in the CVs.
2. After uploading the minutes of 4<sup>th</sup> Meeting of ETEC on the website, one of the bidders represented that CVs submitted by the other two bidders also suffer from the similar mismatch and that the CVs of those personnel should also be evaluated likewise. Committee in its 5<sup>th</sup> meeting dated 13.08.2018 met to consider the representations and recommended that all the firms be requested once to submit legal documents, if any in favour of change of name of the professionals proposed in the CVs. The Committee also recommended that clarification in respect Key Personnel, Mr Naresh Kumar, be also requested regarding his degree, which is issued by an institute not approved by AICTE/UGG. The bidders were also asked to submit their extension of bid validity by one month, on or before 28.08.2018.
3. M/s YONGMA ENGINEERING CO. LTD in association with Mangalam Associates and M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. in association with Segmental Consulting & Infrastructure Advisory Pvt. Ltd. have submitted their clarifications and also confirmed their bid validity extension whereas M/s RODIC Consultants Pvt. Ltd. has neither extended its bid validity nor has furnished any clarifications as required.
4. The Committee met to examine the respective submissions and observed as under:
  - 4.1 M/s YONGMA ENGINEERING CO. LTD in association with Mangalam Associates:
    - (i) The firm has submitted the Change of Name certificate for the Team









Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer, from Mr. Krishan Lal to Mr. Krishan Lal Dogra issued by *Office of the Deputy Commissioner Reasi (J&K)* (Annexure-I). However, the firm has failed to provide any certificate confirming that the institute from which the Material Engineer, Mr. Naresh Kumar graduated is recognized by AICTE or UGC.

4.2.2 The Committee recommended that the CV of Mr. Krishan Lal Dogra may be considered in view of the submission of the document submitted in favour of Change of Name for Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer. CV of Mr Naresh Kumar, Material Engineer, may not be evaluated as the institute from where he graduated is not recognized by AICTE/UGC.

4.2.3 Further, Committee was appraised that vide email dated 31.08.2018, a complaint regarding evaluations of CVs was received in which it was pointed out that Mr K.K. Dhar who is proposed for the position of Bridge Design Specialist also suffers from similar mismatch between the name on the CV and the name on the certificates and that the same should not be considered. Also it has been pointed out that the CV for the position of Quantity Surveyor (Dinesh Kumar Singh) has there profiles available on INFRACON with the same name, DOB and photograph. Whereas, the CVs are for different positions viz Quantity Surveyor, Highway Engineer and Material Engineer and that which is contrary as per the rules/guidelines of INFRACON and hence his CV cannot be considered for evaluation.

4.3 M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. in association with Segmental Consulting & Infrastructure Advisory Pvt. Ltd.: The Committee observed that the firm didn't submit any certificate issued by Government Authority regarding change of name of Sh Ashok Gupta (Bridge Design Specialist) and Sh Jagdish Kumar Gupta (Bridge/Structural Engineer-II), hence it was decided not to evaluate the CVs of these two Key Personnel. However, on its representation on Sh Neeraj Gupta (Bridge & Structural Engineer) regarding not considering is experience in Clause 2 (a) *Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects*, the Committee considered the submission of the bidder and recommended that the project enlisted in Sl No. 9 of the CV of Mr. Neeraj Gupta regarding experience in Highway Tunnels may be accepted in the *Total Professional Experience in handling Highway/Bridge projects* (Annexure-II).

5. In view of M/s RODIC Consultants Pvt. Ltd not confirming their extension of bid validity, the Committee decided that the proposal submitted by the firm may not be considered further as per Clause 1.12 of LOI.

6. The Committee noted that five bids were received in the first instance out of which two became non-responsive. Further, M/s RODIC Consultants Pvt. Ltd. has not extended the bid validity. Remaining two bidders are also not being able to furnish the documents in respect of some of Key Personnel as requested within the given time.

The Committee thus recommended that In view of the large number of complaints and in order to ensure fair competition, the bidding process may be annulled and the bids may be re-invited.

The meeting ended with the vote of thanks to the chair.



Pradeep Sharma, GM (Tech.)

(Member Secretary)



Uttam Chatterjee, DGM (Fin.)

(Member)



Ashok Kumar Gupta GM (Tech.)

(Member)



Adil Singh GM (Tech.)

(Member)



Sanjeev Malik, ED-III

(Convenor)







Office of the Deputy Commissioner  
Reasi

E-Mail:- dcreasi@gmail.com

Phone No:- 01991-245587


Fax No:-01991-245586

**TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN**

Certified that Shri Krishan Lal S/o Late Shri Ambu R/o Ward No. 7, Hari Nagar, Udhampur (J&K) and date of birth 18/01/1954 has changed his name to Shri Krishan Lal Dogra S/o Late Sh. Ambu. His name shall be Shri Krishan Lal Dogra in future.

No:- DC/RSI/R/1955

Dated:- 17-10-2017

  
(Babu Ramesh KAS)  
Additional Deputy Commissioner  
REASI Reasi

Copy to the:-

1. Sh. Krishan Lal Dogra S/o Late Sh. Ambu R/o Ward No. 7, Hari Nagar Udhampur J&K.



Bridge/ Structural Engineer					
			M/s TPF GETINSA EUROESTUDIOS S.L. in association with Segmental Consulting & Infrastructure Advisory Pvt. Ltd.		
			Neeraj Gupta		
			Calculations	Marks Scored	
1	General Qualification	25 marks (Max)	25		
(i)	B.E/B.Tech / A.M.I.E / B.Sc in Civil Engineering from a recognized University	20			20
(ii)	Post Graduate Degree in Structural Engineering	5			0
2	Essential Experience	70 marks (Max)		52.329	
(a)	Total Professional Experience in handling Highway Bridge projects	15 years (Min)	15		
	Marks for "Total Professional Experience in handling Highway Projects"	15 marks (Max)	15		
	(i) Marks for threshold	80%	80%	12	12
	(ii) % increase of marks for every increase in no. of years of experience	6.66% and 20%(max)	0	0	0
(b)	Experience in Construction/Construction Supervision of bridge interchange/any other structures	10 years (Min)	13		
	Marks for "Experience in construction construction Supervision of bridge interchange/any other structures"	15 marks (Max)	15		
	(i) Marks for threshold	80%	80%	12	12
	(ii) increase of marks for every increase in no. of years of experience	6.66% and 20%(max)	3	2.997	2.997
(c)	Experience in similar capacity in Supervision of Major Highway Bridges on Pile/Well foundation	2 Project (Min)	3		
	Marks for "Experience in similar capacity in supervision of Major Highway Bridges on Pile/Well foundation"	15 marks (Max)	15		
	(i) Marks for threshold	80%	80%	12	12
	(ii) increase of marks for every increase in no. of Projects	6.66% and 20%(max)	1	0.999	0.999
(d)	Experience in supervision of Rehabilitation and repair of Major Bridges.	2 Project (min)	2		
	Marks for "Experience in supervision of Rehabilitation and repair of Major Bridges"	10 marks (Max)	10		
	(i) Marks for threshold	80%	80%	8	8
	(ii) increase of marks for every increase in no. of Projects.	6.66% and 20%(max)	0	0	0
(e)	Familiar with modern methods of construction of bridges ROB/flyover involving RCC/pre-stress concrete, design standards, technical specifications and statistical Quality Control/Assurance procedures for construction of different component of bridges.	1 Project (min)	2		
	Marks for "Familiar with modern methods of construction of bridges ROB/flyover involving RCC/pre-stress concrete, design standards, technical specifications and statistical Quality Control/Assurance procedures for construction of different component of bridges."	5 marks (Max)	5		
	(i) Marks for threshold	80%	80%	4	4
	(ii) Increase of marks for every increase in no. of Projects.	6.66% and 20%(max)	1	0.333	0.333
3	Desirable Experience				
	Experience as Bridge Engineer abroad	1 Project	1		
	Marks for "Experience as a Bridge Engineer abroad"	5 marks (Max)	5		
	(i) Marks for threshold	80%	80%	4	4
	(ii) Increase of marks for every increase in no. of Projects.	6.66% and 20%(max)	0	0	0
4	Employment with the firm	1 years (Minimum)	3.49		
	Marks for "Employment with the firm"	5 marks (Maximum)	5		
	(i) Marks for threshold	80%	80%	4	4
	(ii) % increase for marks for every increase in no. Of years of employment with firm.	6.66% and 20% (max)	2.49	0.82917	0.82917
	Total Score	95			85.18317

